

JS 44 (Rev. 06/17)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS

John E. Shamonsky

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff Schuylkill County
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)
Gregory G. Paul, Morgan & Paul, PLLC, 100 First Ave., Suite 1010,
Pittsburgh, PA 15222

DEFENDANTS

Liberty Life Assurance Company of Boston and Carpenter Technology Company STD Plan

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant _____

(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.

Attorneys (If Known)

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff
- ☒ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant
- ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- | | PTF | DEF | | PTF | DEF |
|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| Citizen of This State | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 |
| Citizen of Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | Foreign Nation | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 |

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)Click here for: [Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.](#)

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES	
<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERTY <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other LABOR <input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Management Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="checkbox"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) <input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="checkbox"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
REAL PROPERTY <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	CIVIL RIGHTS <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education	PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Alien Detainee <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 530 General <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty Other: <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition <input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement			

V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☒ 1 Original Proceeding
- ☐ 2 Removed from State Court
- ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court
- ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened
- ☐ 5 Transferred from Another District (specify)
- ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer
- ☐ 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION

Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity):

ERISA 29 U.S.C. Sections 1132(a), (e)(1) and (f)

Brief description of cause:

Denial of short term disability benefits**VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:**

☐ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.

DEMAND \$

CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:

JURY DEMAND: ☐ Yes ☒ No**VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY**

(See instructions):

JUDGE

DOCKET NUMBER

DATE

09/08/2017

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

Greg Paul

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # _____ AMOUNT _____ APPLYING IFP _____ JUDGE _____ MAG. JUDGE _____

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

JOHN E. SHAMONSKY,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Civil Action Number:

LIBERTY LIFE ASSURANCE COMPANY
OF BOSTON and CARPENTER
TECHNOLOGY COMPANY STD PLAN,

Defendants.

COMPLAINT

AND NOW, comes the Plaintiff, John E. Shamonsky, by and through his undersigned counsel and files the within Complaint, to obtain declaratory relief, and recover short-term disability benefits and other employee benefit contributions under an ERISA employee benefit plan, and to recover costs, prejudgment interest and attorney's fees.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

1. This is an action brought pursuant to section 502(a), (e)(1) and (f) of ERISA 29 U.S.C. §§1132(a), (e)(1) and (f). The Court has subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 29 U.S.C. §1132(e)(1), 28 U.S.C. §1331 and 28 U.S.C. §1367(a). Under §502(f) of ERISA, 29 U.S.C. §1132(f), the Court has jurisdiction without respect to the amount in controversy or the citizenship of the parties.

2. Venue is properly laid in this district pursuant to section 502(e)(2) of ERISA, 29 U.S.C. §1132(e)(2), in that the subject employee benefit plan is administered in this district, the breaches of duty herein alleged occurred in this district, and one or more of the defendants

resides or is found in this district, and pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1391(b), in that the causes of action arose in this district.

PARTIES

3. Plaintiff, John E. Shamonsky, is an adult individual who resides in New Philadelphia, PA 17959.

4. Defendant, Liberty Life Assurance Company of Boston, is the underwriting company of the Plan and is located in London, KY 40742-7213.

5. Defendant, Carpenter Technology Company STD Plan, is a benefit plan as defined by ERISA doing business with its principal place of business located at 1735 Market Street, 15th Floor, Philadelphia, PA 19103.

SUMMARY OF ACTION

6. Mr. Shamonsky worked for Carpenter Technology Corporation as a Technician III in the Quality Chemical Lab.

7. On or about September 20, 2016, Mr. Shamonsky was unable to continue working in his own occupation at Carpenter Technology due to symptoms of pain and fatigue associated with his diagnosis of Lyme disease and joint pain.

8. Dr. Young, plaintiff's family physician, issued medical restrictions that Mr. Shamonsky was unable to work on a consistent basis, following an unsuccessful work attempt, from September of 2016 through February 8, 2017. Similarly, Dr. Borofsky, from the Arthritis and Osteoporosis Center, stated that Mr. Shamonsky was unable to work in an assessment dated December 20, 2016.

9. Despite these opinions and medical restrictions, defendants denied Mr. Shamonsky's short-term disability benefits in a letter dated December 1, 2016 and, following an appeal, issued a final denial letter dated January 18, 2017.

10. Liberty Life subsequently approved Mr. Shamonsky's application for long-term disability under the same "own occupation" definition of disability from March of 2017 through the present. Liberty's approval letter specifically found that he met the definition of disability dating back to September 20, 2016 (presumably the elimination period for long-term disability benefits).

11. Under the short-term disability policy, an eligible employee will be considered disabled if he or she is limited from doing the material and substantial duties of his or her Own Job. "Own Job" is defined as "the Employee's job that he was performing when his Disability or Partial Disability began".

12. As a result of Defendants' denial of short-term disability benefits, Plaintiff has not received the monthly benefits and other contributions under the plan to which he is entitled including short-term disability benefits from September 26, 2016 through March 25, 2017.

COUNT ONE
(CLAIM FOR BENEFITS UNDER THE PLAN- 29 USC 1132(a)(1)(B))

13. The averments set forth in the above paragraphs are incorporated by reference.

14. The Plan provides the Plaintiff is entitled to replacement disability income ("Disability Benefits") and other benefits based upon his becoming disabled within the meaning of the Plan.

15. Plaintiff has established his disability within the meaning of the Plan and is entitled to Disability Benefits because he is limited from performing the material and substantial duties of his regular occupation due to his sickness or injury.

16. Plaintiff is entitled to payment of the Disability Benefits under the Plan because his medical conditions and symptoms prevent him from performing the material and substantial duties of his regular occupation requiring lifting and carrying up to forty pounds according to the job description.

17. Defendants' denial of own occupation short-term disability benefits and other contributions under the plan constitutes denial of benefits governed by ERISA.

18. Plaintiff has exhausted all administrative levels of appeal by the issuance of the final denial letter dated January 18, 2017.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, John E. Shamonsky, respectfully prays that the court: (1) declare that the Defendants are obligated to pay Plaintiff his past due disability benefits and all other contributions and benefits under the plan; (2) award Plaintiff the costs of this action, interest, and reasonable attorneys' fees; and (3) award such other further and different relief as may be just and proper.

Respectfully submitted,

MORGAN & PAUL, PLLC



GREGORY G. PAUL

PA ID No.: 83334

First and Market Building

100 First Avenue, Suite 1010

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

(412) 259-8375

(888) 822-9421 (facsimile)

gregpaul@morgan-paul.com

Attorney for Plaintiff

Dated: September 8, 2017.

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

John E. Shamonsky	:	CIVIL ACTION
	:	
v.	:	
Liberty Life Assurance Company of Boston	:	
and Carpenter Technology Company STD Plan	:	NO.

In accordance with the Civil Justice Expense and Delay Reduction Plan of this court, counsel for plaintiff shall complete a Case Management Track Designation Form in all civil cases at the time of filing the complaint and serve a copy on all defendants. (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the reverse side of this form.) In the event that a defendant does not agree with the plaintiff regarding said designation, that defendant shall, with its first appearance, submit to the clerk of court and serve on the plaintiff and all other parties, a Case Management Track Designation Form specifying the track to which that defendant believes the case should be assigned.

SELECT ONE OF THE FOLLOWING CASE MANAGEMENT TRACKS:

- (a) Habeas Corpus – Cases brought under 28 U.S.C. § 2241 through § 2255. ()
- (b) Social Security – Cases requesting review of a decision of the Secretary of Health and Human Services denying plaintiff Social Security Benefits. ()
- (c) Arbitration – Cases required to be designated for arbitration under Local Civil Rule 53.2. ()
- (d) Asbestos – Cases involving claims for personal injury or property damage from exposure to asbestos. ()
- (e) Special Management – Cases that do not fall into tracks (a) through (d) that are commonly referred to as complex and that need special or intense management by the court. (See reverse side of this form for a detailed explanation of special management cases.) ()
- (f) Standard Management – Cases that do not fall into any one of the other tracks. (X)

<u>09/08/2017</u>	<u>Gregory G. Paul</u>	<u>Plaintiff</u>
Date	Attorney-at-law	Attorney for
<u>(412) 259-8375</u>	<u>(888) 822-9421</u>	<u>gregpaul@morgan-paul.com</u>
Telephone	FAX Number	E-Mail Address

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA — DESIGNATION FORM to be used by counsel to indicate the category of the case for the purpose of assignment to appropriate calendar.

Address of Plaintiff: Plaintiff resides in New Philadelphia, PA

Address of Defendant: Defendant Life Assurance Company of Boston is located in London, KY; Defendant Carpenter Technology Company STD Plan is located in Philadelphia, PA.

Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction: _____
(Use Reverse Side For Additional Space)

Does this civil action involve a nongovernmental corporate party with any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation owning 10% or more of its stock?

(Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statement Form in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 7.1(a))

Yes ☐ No ☒

Does this case involve multidistrict litigation possibilities?

Yes ☐ No ☒

RELATED CASE, IF ANY:

Case Number: _____ Judge _____ Date Terminated: _____

Civil cases are deemed related when yes is answered to any of the following questions:

1. Is this case related to property included in an earlier numbered suit pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court?
Yes ☐ No ☒
2. Does this case involve the same issue of fact or grow out of the same transaction as a prior suit pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court?
Yes ☐ No ☒
3. Does this case involve the validity or infringement of a patent already in suit or any earlier numbered case pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court?
Yes ☐ No ☒
4. Is this case a second or successive habeas corpus, social security appeal, or pro se civil rights case filed by the same individual?
Yes ☐ No ☒

CIVIL: (Place ☒ in ONE CATEGORY ONLY)

A. Federal Question Cases:

1. ☐ Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and All Other Contracts
2. ☐ FELA
3. ☐ Jones Act-Personal Injury
4. ☐ Antitrust
5. ☐ Patent
6. ☐ Labor-Management Relations
7. ☐ Civil Rights
8. ☐ Habeas Corpus
9. ☐ Securities Act(s) Cases
10. ☐ Social Security Review Cases
11. ☒ All other Federal Question Cases
(Please specify) ERISA

B. Diversity Jurisdiction Cases:

1. ☐ Insurance Contract and Other Contracts
2. ☐ Airplane Personal Injury
3. ☐ Assault, Defamation
4. ☐ Marine Personal Injury
5. ☐ Motor Vehicle Personal Injury
6. ☐ Other Personal Injury (Please specify)
7. ☐ Products Liability
8. ☐ Products Liability — Asbestos
9. ☐ All other Diversity Cases
(Please specify) _____

ARBITRATION CERTIFICATION

(Check Appropriate Category)

I, Gregory G. Paul, counsel of record do hereby certify:

- ☐ Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Section 3(c)(2), that to the best of my knowledge and belief, the damages recoverable in this civil action case exceed the sum of \$150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs;
- ☒ Relief other than monetary damages is sought.

DATE: 09/08/2017

Gregory G. Paul

Attorney-at-Law

83334

Attorney I.D.#

NOTE: A trial de novo will be a trial by jury only if there has been compliance with F.R.C.P. 38.

I certify that, to my knowledge, the within case is not related to any case now pending or within one year previously terminated action in this court except as noted above.

DATE: 09/08/2017

Greg Paul
Attorney-at-Law

Attorney I.D.#